

Audit Committee

May 8, 2025

Meeting Date

September 4, 2025

Date Minutes Were Approved


Max White (Sep 9, 2025 11:12:16 PDT)

Chair

CERTIFICATION AND ATTESTATION

I hereby certify that the accompanying document is a true and correct copy of the minutes of the aforementioned meeting. I further certify that the meeting was duly called and held, and that the quorum was present.


Emily Soria (Sep 9, 2025 07:51:26 PDT)

Staff Liaison



MINUTES OF THE AVONDALE AUDIT COMMITTEE
CITY OF AVONDALE, ARIZONA
SONORAN CONFERENCE ROOM
May 8, 2025

A **Regular Meeting** of the Audit Committee of the City of Avondale, Arizona was convened at 11465 West Civic Center Drive in open and public session at 2:03 p.m.

Voting Members Present: Chair White; Vice Chair Cook; Committee Member Nielson; Committee Member Solorio; and Committee Member Pacheco.

Non-Voting Members Present: Committee Member Corbin and Committee Member Weatherless.

Members Absent: None.

Other Municipal Officials Present: Barbara Coppage, City Auditor; Nicholle Harris, City Attorney; and Marcella Sarmiento, City Clerk.

Audience: No members of the public were present.

1. Roll Call

2. Introductions

No guests were present; therefore, no introductions were provided.

3. Approval of Audit Committee Minutes

Committee Member Pacheco moved to approve the February 13, 2025, meeting minutes; Committee Member Nielson seconded the motion.

Upon vote, the motion was carried unanimously 5 to 0.

Chair White	Aye
Vice Chair Cook	Aye
Committee Member Nielson	Aye
Committee Member Solorio	Aye
Committee Member Pacheco	Aye

4. Audit Status Report

Barbara Coppage, City Auditor, presented an overview of ongoing projects for the fiscal year 2025 approved Audit Plan.

Active Directory Audit Part 1 - The external auditor, ran many tests behind the scenes and through the system. They looked at results in terms of critical, moderate, and low risk. There was one area of high risk and Information Technology (IT) is currently working on it. Several moderate controls were found which IT is working on and anticipate completion by June 30, 2025.

Active Director Part II, was completed in-house with external auditor oversight. The audit focused on policies for user access and to review the active users on active directory. IT is working currently working on recommendations made for this audit.

In response to Chair White question, Ms. Coppage stated she would provide an answer later on questions about an authenticator app. Vice Chair, Cook, commented on the importance of monitoring contractors access.

The Police Pension Calculations and Contributions audit was completed. The City contributed \$4.6 million into the Public Safety Pension Program. Ms. Coppage used data analytics to review the entire population and identified 64 incidents affecting 23 to 25 employees. Also noted was two non-police part-time employees that should have been contributing to the ASRS pension plan but were not. Human Resources is examining and strengthening their controls for part-time employees.

Mr. Corbin noted the dates on the slides are before the audit was completed and provided Ms. Coppage and Mr. Mesquita with accolades for ensuring the payroll is the most accurate it has been for many years.

The Developers Contributed Assets and Agreements is currently in fieldwork. The Vendor Master File is currently tabled but will be proposed as a new audit for next Fiscal Year's Audit Plan to be completed by an external auditor. All audit reports will now include a Report Highlights area in place of the Executive Summary.

The End of Year Activity Report was provided to all Audit Committee members. The City Auditor will also start sending surveys with final reports.

5. Citywide Risk Assessment and Annual Audit Plan

Barbara Coppage, City Auditor, presented the Citywide Risk Assessment and the Annual Audit Plan. Noting there are three oversight departments that have policies and procedures other departments must follow and have an impact on the operations of the City. Some of the projects indicate "Citywide" which means more than one department will be impacted. How many departments will be impacted is determined upon completion of the planning stage. This Audit Plan focusses on risk and also to connect with as many departments as possible. Ms. Coppage discussed the collaborative effort with the City of Surprise, the City of Glendale, a representative from PSPRS and the City of Peoria to identify high-risk audit areas within local government.

Ms. Coppage reviewed and discussed the proposed Audit Plan. After discussion regarding a less zealous plan to allow time to prepare for the certification process in FY27, the following audits were approved.

Approved Proposed Audits Discussed:

- Unscheduled Point of Sale Verifications
- Developer Agreements and Contributed Assets

- Purchasing Card Expenditures
- Vendor Master File and Accounts Payable
- Overtime Analysis
- Facilities Maintenance, after discussion this will be transferred to the contingency list.
- IT Audits are being added to the contingency list.

Ms. Coppage provided highlights on some of the audits in the Audit Plan such as the Police Overtime Analysis. Chair White suggested changing the title to Public Safety Overtime Analysis because Public Safety is the umbrella organization for the Police and Fire.

A place holder was put on the Audit Plan allows for flexibility in the event the Audit Committee or management request additional audit services.

The Integrity Line was also discussed. The Audit Department has limited capacity to conduct investigations and would like to work on creating an Investigation Manual. A discussion ensued among Ms. Coppage, Audit Committee, City Manager Corbin, and City Attorney Harris regarding the auditor's involvement and information to be contained in the manual. Further conversation would take place offline.

Ms. Coppage discussed some requirements to pass the Generally Accepted Government Auditing Standards certification. This process includes auditors conducting a review of the Avondale audit shop and determining if the shop's processes comply with standards. The Auditor Quality Assurance project on the proposed audit plan is to comply with one of these standards. Chair White read the Yellow Book Peer Review requirements aloud. A discussion ensued among committee members and Ms. Coppage.

Committee Member Solorio moved to recommend approval of the proposed Annual Audit Plan for the fiscal year 2025/2026 with the discussed provisions; Committee Member Pacheco seconded the motion.

Upon vote, the motion was carried unanimously 5 to 0.

Chair White	Aye
Vice Chair Cook	Aye
Committee Member Nielson	Aye
Committee Member Solorio	Aye
Committee Member Pacheco	Aye

6. City Auditor End of the Year Report

Barbara Copping, City Auditor, provided a summary of accomplishments completed during this year. The Marketing and the Human Resources Departments were recognized for their collaborative efforts in formatting the report.

The following accomplishments were discussed:

- Establishing Operational Resilience
- Audit Plan Completion
- Being on target with Strategic Plan Goals
- The Recommendation Follow-up Enhancement that uses an electronic dashboard.

In response to Ms. Copping's request, the Audit Committee members agreed to have a photo taken at the next meeting to be added to the Audit Website.

7. Government Auditing Standards Certification

Chair White noted under Agenda Item #5 she read into the record the Yellow Book Peer Review requirements that were discussed at that time. Ms. Coppage stated there was nothing further to add.

8. CALENDAR

The proposed Audit Committee meeting dates for the calendar year 2025 were presented. This item was for discussion only. The next meeting scheduled will be on Thursday, September 4, 2025, at 2:00 p.m.

9. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business before the Committee, Committee Member Cook moved to adjourn the meeting; Committee Member Solorio seconded the motion.

Upon vote, the motion was carried unanimously 5 to 0.

Chair White	Aye
Vice Chair Cook	Aye
Committee Member Nielson	Aye
Committee Member Solorio	Aye
Committee Member Pacheco	Aye

Meeting adjourned at 3:15 p.m.